



Theme 5

The Birth of Rugby League

Pupil Activity Sheet 1

Broken Time Payments

The following quotes are set in 1893 and give the main arguments for and against broken time payments at that time.

Read the quotes and decide whether each person is **for** or **against** broken time payments for rugby players. Show your answer by writing 'for' or 'against' after each quote.

Give a **mark out of 5** for how strong you think the person's reason is, 5 being an excellent reason and 1 being a very weak reason.

When you have finished, write your marks into the table on the last page, add them up and decide whether your group is in favour of broken time payments for rugby players.

1. "Matches often start late because players cannot leave work early without losing some of their wages. In winter, matches that start late have to stop early as it gets dark. Home teams sometimes get an easy game because the away teams have to travel further. Sometimes their best players will not leave work soon enough to play, because they cannot afford to lose part of their wages. We could stop this if we paid them for broken time."

for or against? _____ **marks out of 5?** _____

2. "If a player cannot afford to lose money from his wages then he should not play."

for or against? _____ **marks out of 5?** _____

3. "To expect working men to lose money to play rugby is unfair. Why should they lose money to play? Those who say you shouldn't play unless you can afford to take time off work are taking rugby away from the poor and making it a game of the rich."

for or against? _____ **marks out of 5?** _____

4. "If we allow broken time pay, bosses who are not interested in rugby will not employ players who might ask to leave work early to play. The players will suffer because it will make it harder for them to get a job."

for or against? _____ **marks out of 5?** _____

5. "Broken time pay is banned in athletics and hockey. They decided that in 1892. Rugby should be no different."

for or against? _____ **marks out of 5?** _____

6. "Broken time pay is allowed in football and cricket. Rugby should be no different."

for or against? _____ **marks out of 5?** _____

7. "The best players are given good jobs so that they will go to a club or so that they will stop there. How much of their pay is for working and how much is for playing rugby? Broken time pay will make this worse because clubs will just pay the players what they want and call it broken time pay. The players would then be professionals and we do not want professional rugby players. They will just play to win at all costs rather than in the spirit of true sportsmen."

for or against? _____ **marks out of 5?** _____

8. "The poorer players are not given good jobs. In these hard times they need broken time payments so that they can afford to play."

for or against? _____ **marks out of 5?** _____

9. "These are hard times. Since 1890 pay has been cut and jobs have been lost. Look at all the trouble we've had in rugby towns and cities:

- miners setting fire to the Pilkington Glass Factory in St Helens because the Pilkingtons have sacked miners in their coal pits;
- troops charging the striking mill workers in Bradford Town Hall Square;
- a five-month lock out at the Oldham cotton mills;
- gunboats on the River Humber after violence from striking dock workers in Hull;
- two pickets shot dead by the army outside a coal mine at Featherstone.

When work is so short and wages so low this idea that rugby players should lose money to play is out of touch with the lives of working men."

for or against? _____ **marks out of 5?** _____

10. Paying broken time will make the poor clubs go bust. They will have to pay money they cannot afford or lose their players to clubs which can pay. Most of them can barely afford the team's rail fares to away matches.

for or against? _____ **marks out of 5?** _____

In the table below, write the marks you have given for arguments **for** and the marks you have given for arguments **against** broken time payments (only one mark, for or against, for each quote). Add up the marks in each column.

Quote Number	Marks	
	For	Against
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
Total		

Is your group for or against broken time payments for rugby players?
